June 13, 2018

Mayor Andy Schor 9<sup>th</sup> floor, City Hall 124 W. Michigan Ave. Lansing, Michigan 48933

Re: Your memo dated March 15, 2018 delivered to Ways and Means Committee on March 22, 2018 - Teamster 580 Retiree Healthcare Benefits

Dear Mr. Schor:

I am unaware if you received my response dated April 17, 2018. Follow-up on my part was not responded to by your office staff (telephone call and email.)

Since 2010 (retirees) and the 2014 through 2018 Ways and Means Committee have basically requested from City Administration the same information, same documents and answers to the same basic repeated questions.

I don't see where your memo answers these questions. I see you also relied on previous Bernero staff members to prepare your statement. Since you had only been in office for 2 ½ months I can maybe see where you had to depend on others. But these are the same people that appeared on your behalf at the March 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting and again refused to supply requested information. This lack of transparency now continues into your administration.

I am also not sure if you knew what the exact complaint(s) were of the retirees? Did you sit down with Carol Wood? Jody Washington? a rep of the Teamster Local? any retirees?

- In simple terms I believe you are saying in your memo that the contract in question (2-1-2003-1-31 2007 Teamsters 580), died and or/terminated on 1-31-2007. Actually this supports and backs up part of our complaint. City Administration in 2010 could not go back and open a "dead contract" and create new language.
- 2. I believe your memo is saying that healthcare can then be re-negotiated for retirees after the dead contract. Not clear with whom? the union? the retirees? The first negotiated date certain that pertains to premium rates being tie-barred to actives is May 2014. It is unfortunate that the previous administration tried to pretend that premium rates were tie-barred to actives as of 2-20-2004. Again the date of 2-20-2004 is related to drug co-pay changes only. So now we have a 10 year period where unauthorized premiums were deducted from Teamster retiree pensions.
- 3. **DISCRIMINATION:** Biggest unanswered question. How can you divide one class/one group of retirees and make up a date where some are "grand fathered in"? And others are required to pay. Please reference my attached FOIA reply on

Andy Schor, Mayor June 13, 2018 Page Two

said CTP contract. Why did eleven (11) retirees in 2010 get to keep their full benefits at no cost and twenty (20) retirees automatically became tie-barred to actives? How can 2-1-2003 through 2-19-2004 of the contract **NOT DIE and continues to be alive and well even in 2018** but the rest of the contract from 2-20-2004 and on died in January 2007?

4. How can the same exact Teamster contract language be in all the contracts from the 1980's through 2007, but retirees before 2-20-2004 do not follow actives?

Your memo again seems to indicate contracts die, states all kinds of court cases, etc. I did fail to see an explanation as to why the City of Lansing, as a public municipal employer, could pick the haves and the have-nots. I did fail to see an explanation as to why John Doe who retired in 2003 kept his benefits at no cost and poor Jane Doe who retired in 2004 is now paying as much as \$800.00 a month for same said benefits. Same exact contract..same exact language. How can that be?

I think you can certainly agree that the City of Lansing has a due diligence to ensure that its benefits under one group of retirees is not discriminatory. I think you would also agree under transparency that if someone is asking City government the same questions for eight years they are certainly entitled to answers.

Now City Council had to drop our issue from its agenda because of the continued lack of response of City staff and refusal to supply information. I certainly don't call that transparency. What is the City hiding?

The retirees believe our issue and complaint to go unanswered. I would think at a minimum you would do a sit down with some of the retirees and City Council members. I think you heard one side of the story...from those that tried to bury reports and keep information out of the hands of council. Our side has nothing to hide.

Sincerely,

Denise Estee

2923 Greenbriar Ave. Lansing, Michigan 48912 517-485-3608